

1 THE HONORABLE JAMES L. ROBART
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

9 MICROSOFT CORPORATION,

10 Plaintiff,

11 vs.

12 MOTOROLA, INC., et al.,

13 Defendants.

14 MOTOROLA MOBILITY, INC., et al.,

15 Plaintiffs,

16 vs.

17 MICROSOFT CORPORATION,

18 Defendants.

Case No. C10-1823-JLR

(PROPOSED) ORDER DENYING
MOTOROLA'S *DAUBERT* MOTION
TO EXCLUDE CERTAIN TESTIMONY
OF PLAINTIFF'S EXPERTS DRs.
LYNDE, MURPHY, AND SIMCOE

Noted: Monday, September 10, 2012

ORAL ARGUMENT REQUESTED

19 This matter came before the Court on Motorola's *Daubert* Motion to Exclude Certain
20 Testimony of Plaintiff's Experts Drs. Lynde, Murphy, and Simcoe. Based on the pleadings
21 and materials submitted by the Parties in support of, or in opposition to, Motorola's Motion,
22

23 **IT IS ORDERED THAT** Motorola's Motion to Exclude Certain Testimony of
24 Plaintiff's Experts Drs. Lynde, Murphy, and Simcoe is DENIED.

25
(PROPOSED) ORDER DENYING MOTOROLA'S
DAUBERT MOTION TO EXCLUDE CERTAIN
TESTIMONY OF PLAINTIFF'S EXPERTS DRs.
LYNDE, MURPHY, AND SIMCOE - 1

LAW OFFICES
CALFO HARRIGAN LEYH & EAKES LLP
999 THIRD AVENUE, SUITE 4400
SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98104
TEL, (206) 623-1700 FAX, (206) 623-8717

1 DATED this _____ day of September, 2012.
2
3

HONORABLE JAMES L. ROBART

4 Presented by:
5

6 CALFO HARRIGAN LEYH & EAKES LLP
7

8 By /s/ Arthur W. Harrigan, Jr.
9 Arthur W. Harrigan, Jr., WSBA #1751
Christopher Wion, WSBA #33207
Shane P. Cramer, WSBA #35099

10 T. Andrew Culbert
11 David E. Killough
MICROSOFT CORPORATION
1 Microsoft Way
12 Redmond, WA 98052
Phone: 425-882-8080
13 Fax: 425-869-1327

14 David T. Pritikin
15 Richard A. Cederoth
Constantine L. Trela, Jr.
William H. Baumgartner, Jr.
16 Ellen S. Robbins
Douglas I. Lewis
David C. Giardina
18 John W. McBride
David Greenfield

19 SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP
20 One South Dearborn
21 Chicago, IL 60603
Phone: 312-853-7000
22 Fax: 312-853-7036

23
24
25
(PROPOSED) ORDER DENYING MOTOROLA'S
DAUBERT MOTION TO EXCLUDE CERTAIN
TESTIMONY OF PLAINTIFF'S EXPERTS DRS.
LYNDE, MURPHY, AND SIMCOE - 2

LAW OFFICES
CALFO HARRIGAN LEYH & EAKES LLP
999 THIRD AVENUE, SUITE 4400
SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98104
TEL, (206) 623-1700 FAX, (206) 623-8717

1 Carter G. Phillips
2 Brian R. Nester
3 SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP
4 1501 K Street NW
5 Washington, DC 20005
6 Telephone: 202-736-8000
7 Fax: 202-736-8711

8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
Counsel for Microsoft Corp.

(PROPOSED) ORDER DENYING MOTOROLA'S
DAUBERT MOTION TO EXCLUDE CERTAIN
TESTIMONY OF PLAINTIFF'S EXPERTS DRs.
LYNDE, MURPHY, AND SIMCOE - 3

LAW OFFICES
CALFO HARRIGAN LEYH & EAKES LLP
999 THIRD AVENUE, SUITE 4400
SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98104
TEL, (206) 623-1700 FAX, (206) 623-8717

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Linda Bledsoe, swear under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of Washington to the following:

1. I am over the age of 21 and not a party to this action.
2. On the 5th day of September, 2012, I caused the preceding document to be served on counsel of record in the following manner:

Attorneys for Motorola Solutions, Inc., and Motorola Mobility, Inc.:

Ralph Palumbo, WSBA #04751
Philip S. McCune, WSBA #21081
Lynn M. Engel, WSBA #21934
Summit Law Group
315 Fifth Ave. South, Suite 1000
Seattle, WA 98104-2682
Telephone: 206-676-7000
Email: Summit1823@summitlaw.com

Messenger
 US Mail
 Facsimile
 X ECF

Steven Pepe (*pro hac vice*)
Jesse J. Jenner (*pro hac vice*)
Ropes & Gray LLP
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036-8704
Telephone: (212) 596-9046
Email: steven.pepe@ropesgray.com
Email: jesse.jenner@ropesgray.com

Messenger
 US Mail
 Facsimile
 X ECF

Norman H. Beamer (*pro hac vice*)
Ropes & Gray LLP
1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor
East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284
Telephone: (650) 617-4030
Email: norman.beamer@ropesgray.com

Messenger
 US Mail
 Facsimile
 ECF

(PROPOSED) ORDER DENYING MOTOROLA'S
DAUBERT MOTION TO EXCLUDE CERTAIN
TESTIMONY OF PLAINTIFF'S EXPERTS DRS.
LYNDE, MURPHY, AND SIMCOE - 4

LAW OFFICES
CALFO HARRIGAN LEYH & EAKES LLP
999 THIRD AVENUE, SUITE 4400
SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98104
TEL (206) 623-1700 FAX (206) 623-8717

1 Paul M. Schoenhard (*pro hac vice*)
2 Ropes & Gray LLP
3 One Metro Center
4 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900
5 Washington, DC 20005-3948
6 Telephone: (202) 508-4693
7 Email: Paul.schoenhard@ropesgray.com

_____ Messenger
_____ US Mail
_____ Facsimile
 ECF

8
9
10 DATED this 5th day of September, 2012.
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

7 s/ Linda Bledsoe
8 LINDA BLEDSOE
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

(PROPOSED) ORDER DENYING MOTOROLA'S
DAUBERT MOTION TO EXCLUDE CERTAIN
TESTIMONY OF PLAINTIFF'S EXPERTS DRs.
LYNDE, MURPHY, AND SIMCOE - 5

LAW OFFICES
CALFO HARRIGAN LEYH & EAKES LLP
999 THIRD AVENUE, SUITE 4400
SEATTLE, WASHINGTON 98104
TEL, (206) 623-1700 FAX, (206) 623-8717